

REPORT OF AIRCRAFT ACCIDENT

Use this form in accordance with AF Reg. 52-14 and AF Manual 62-5 "Aircraft Accident Investigators Handbook." Fill in all spaces applicable. If additional space is needed, use additional sheet(s) and identify by proper section letter and subsection number.

{99999} Section A – GENERAL INFORMATION {2999-2}

1. Place of Accident, State, County, nearest town – Distance and direction to accident [Unknown]
2. Nearest Airport suitable for landing this plane – Distance and direction to accident [Unknown]
3. Elevation above S. L. at accident scene [Unknown]
4. Date of accident [23 Nov 53]
5. Hour and time zone [Unknown]
6. Day Night Dawn Dusk
7. List Numbers of All Other Aircraft Involved [None]
8. Incident to Flight Not Incident to Flight
9. Classification of Accident Major Minor
10. Clearance IFR VFR Local Other
If Other: [Kinross AFB on an Active Air Defense Mission]
11. This was a: CAP Flight Air Reserve Flight ANG Flight Other
12. Fire Occurred Before Accident Fire Occurred After Accident Fire Did Not Occur
[Unknown]
13. Airfield of Last Takeoff [Kinross AFB]
14. Duration of Flight Since Last Takeoff [Unknown]
15. Mission of Flight (Use Form ?Symbol) [0] <zero>
16. Activity Aircraft was Engaged in Just Prior to Accident [Unknown]

Section B - AIRCRAFT

1. Aircraft Number [51-5853-A]
2. Type, Model, Series and Block No. [F-89C]
3. Organization Reporting Aircraft on AF 110? Report
Major Command [ADC] {ADC}
Subcommand [EADF] {EAD}
AF Wing [4706th AIR DEF WING] {DEF}
Group Number and Type [520 AD GP] {ADF}
Squadron [433FIS] {FI}
Base [TRUAX AFB WISCONSIN] {6330}

Section C – OPERATOR (Person at controls at time of accident)

1. Last Name (Jr., II., etc) First Name Middle Name [MONCLA FELIX EGGENE JR.]
Grade [1st Lt]
Component [USAFR]
Serial No. [A01858910]
Nationality and Race [U.S. Cau]
Year of Birth [1926]
2. Assigned Base [TRUAX AFB WISC]
Major Command [ADC]
Subcommand [EADF]
AF Wing [4706th AD WG]
Group Number and Type [520 AD GP]
Squadron or Unit [433 FIS]
3. Attached Base For? Flying [TRUAX AFB WISC] {6330}
Major Command [ADC] {ADC}
Subcommand [EADF] {EAD}
AF Wing [4706th AD WG] {DEF}

Group Number and Type [520 AD GP] {ADF}

Squadron or Unit [433 FIS] {FI}

4. Original Aeronautical Rating and Date Received [Pilot 9 Feb 1952]
5. Permanent Aeronautical Rating and Date Received [Pilot 9 Feb 1952]
6. Primary Duty Assignment [PILOT]

OPERATOR'S FLYING EXPERIENCE (Including Civilian)

7. Type of Instrument Card [White] Expiration Date [21Oct54]
8. Total Pilot (1st Pilot, Copilot, Command Pilot, etc.) Hours [811:10]
9. Total 1st Pilot Hours {33.8} [473.05]
10. 1st Pilot Hours Last 90 Days [48:45]
11. 1st Pilot Hours Last 30 Days [19:00]
12. 1st Pilot Hours This Model (B-25, F-51, etc.) [121:40]
13. Other Pilot Hours (CP, C, SC) This Model [NONE]
14. 1st Pilot Hours Last 90 Days This Model [41:30]
15. 1st Pilot Hours Last 30 Days This Model [19:00]
16. Total Time Spent in Air During 24 Hours Prior to Accident [:30]
17. List by Type and Model 1st Pilot Experience in Similar Aircraft (e.g. B-26, 50 Hrs.)
[T-33A 131:15] [F-94B 6:30] [F-89 121:40]
18. Was Operator on Instruments at Time of Accident or Immediately Before?
[] No [X] Unk [] Hood [] Weather
If above answer is yes or if accident occurred at night or during IFR weather or unknown conditions, fill in items below.
19. 1st Pilot Instrument Weather Hours [14:30]
20. 1st Pilot Instrument Hood Hours [86:30]
21. 1st Pilot Instrument (Weather and Hood) Hours Last 6 Months [27:30]
22. 1st Pilot Instrument (Weather and Hood) Hours Last 60 Days [11:35]
23. 1st Pilot Instrument Night Hours Last 6 Months [15:35]
24. 1st Pilot Instrument Night Hours THIS MODEL Last 60 Days [7:55]

Section D – PERSONNEL INVOLVED

(Including operator and all other persons, whether in plane or not)

Duty at Time of Accident (1) [P] {01}

Name (Last Name First) (2) [Moncla, Felix Eugen Jr.]

Type of Aero-Rating (Symbol) (3) [P]

Serial Number (4) [A01858910] {B}

Grade and Branch of Service (5) [1st Lt USAFR]

Component (See AFM 62-5) (6) [READ]

Organizational Assignment – Command, Subcommand, Group Number and Type, Base (7)

{ADC} {6330} [ADC, EADF, 520 Air Defense Gp Truax AFB Wisc.]

Fatal, Major, Minor, None, Missing (8) [Missing] {4}

Parachute Used Yes (9) No (10) [Unk]

Duty at Time of Accident (1) [VO] {07}

Name (Last Name First) (2) [Wilson, Robert I]

Type of Aero-Rating (Symbol) (3) [RO]

Serial Number (4) [A03005692] {B}

Grade and Branch of Service (5) [2nd Lt USAFR]

Component (See AFM 62-5) (6) [READ]

Organizational Assignment – Command, Subcommand, Group Number and Type, Base (7)

[ADC, EADF, 520 Air Defense Gp Truax AFB Wisc.]

Fatal, Major, Minor, None, Missing (8) [Missing] {4}

Parachute Used Yes (9) No (10) [Unk]

RESTRICTED (WHEN FILLED IN)

Section F – RATED PERSONNEL AT OTHER SET OF DUAL CONTROLS
(Instructor, Copilot, etc)

1. Last Name, (Jr., II, etc.) First Name Middle Name [NONE]
< Items 2 – 31 not answered because of answer “NONE” to Item 1 above >

Section F - DAMAGE

1. Describe briefly in General terms the Extent of Damage to the Airplane, Engines and Propellers.
[MISSING] {4} {D-802,858}
< Items 2 – 6 not answered because of answer “MISSING” to Item 1 above >
7. Give below a considered estimate of the cost of this accident to the Air Force
- Cost of Damage to Aircraft [\$873,075.00]
 - Cost of Damage to other Government Property [\$.00]
 - Cost of Damage to Private Property [\$.00]
 - Cost of Injuries [\$100,000.00]
 - Cost – Other (Explain) [Cost of Search] [\$5,000.00]
 - Total Estimated Coat of Accident [\$78,075,00]

Section G – SPECIAL EQUIPMENT

1. Check items of special equipment which affected this accident
- Radios
 - Armament
 - De-Icers
 - Equipment for Clear Vision from Cockpit
 - Instruments
 - Fire extinguishing equipment in plane
 - JATO
 - [Unknown]

Section H – WEATHER (At time and place of accident)

Ceiling [Unknown]
Visibility [Unknown]
Wind Direction and Velocity [Unknown]
Temp. [Unknown]
Dew Point [Unknown]
Other Weather Conditions [Unknown]

If weather other than unfavorable wind conditions for takeoff, landing, taxiing was a factor in the accident, attach statement of weather officer describing climatic conditions and how they probably contributed to the accident.

Section I – CHECKLIST FOR ATTACHMENTS

- Form 1
- Form 1A
- List of T.O's Not C/W

- [See cover sheet for complete index < Not included in release >
 - Clearance
 - Crew Member's Statements
 - Witness Statements
 - Photographs
 - Form 14A
 - Form 14B
 - Form 14C
 - Form 14D
 - Form 14E
-

RESTRICTED (WHEN FILLED IN)

Section O – DESCRIPTION OF ACCIDENT

Tell in narrative form, in as much detail as necessary, everything is known about the accident. Make certain that items checked on reverse side are justified by this narrative. If fire was involved in accident, explain in detail its origin and progress and steps take to extinguish it.

Aircraft took off at 2322 Zebra 23 Nov 53 on an active Air Defense Mission to intercept an unknown aircraft approximately 160 miles Northwest of Kinross Air Force Base. The aircraft was under radar control throughout the interception. At approximately 2352 Zebra the last radio contact was made by the radar station controlling the interception. At approximately 2355 Zebra the unknown aircraft and the F-89 merged together on the radar scope. Shortly thereafter the IFF signal disappeared from the radar scope. No further contact was established with the F-89. < Approximately 16 characters followed by one whole line (of approx. 83 characters including spaces) excised > An extensive aerial search has revealed no trace of the aircraft. The aircraft and its crew is still missing.

RECOMMENDATIONS for action to prevent similar accidents:

- < One line of approximately 70 characters including spaces excised >
- < One line of approximately 24 characters including spaces excised >

Section P – AUTHENTICATION (Each investigating board member must sign below)

1. Personnel Responsible for This Accident Have Been Offered Opportunity for Rebuttal
 No Rebuttal Rcv'd Rebuttal Statement(s) Attached
 2. Personnel Responsible Not Available Because Of:
 Death Critical Injury Other (Explain) [Personnel Missing]
Base Submitting Report [KINROSS AFB, MICHIGAN]
Member (Name and Grade) { /s/ } [FORREST F. PARHAM, MAJOR]
Medical Officer (Name and Grade) { /s/ } [DANIEL W SHEA, CAPTAIN]
R? (Name and Grade) { /s/ } [HARRY N. CASSMMAN?, MAJOR]
Aircraft Accident Officer (Name and Grade) { /s/ } [DAVID C. COLLINS, CAPTAIN]
Recorder (Name and Grade) { /s/ } [DAVID C. COLLINS, CAPTAIN]0
-

< The following two pages have a different appearance than all other pages of the Report. These two pages are dull-finish photocopied pages, the other pages are all slick-finish prints from a microfilm printer. The text on these two pages appears as if it was produced on an electric typewriter or word processor in that there is no variation in alignment or strike strength of the characters. The text on the two pages is double-spaced. >

SUMMARY OR CIRCUMSTANCES

F-89c, Serial No. 51-5853A, assigned to the 433rd Fighter Interceptor Squadron, Truax Field, Wisconsin, was reported missing over Lake Superior at approximately 2000 Eastern Standard Time (EST) on 23 November 1953. The aircraft was scrambled from Kinross Air Force Base, Michigan to participate in an Active Air Defense Mission. The aircraft and aircrew had not been located as of 1 January 1954.

On 23 November 1953, F-89c, Serial No. 51-5853A, was scrambled by "Naples" GCI to intercept and identify an unknown aircraft flying over Lake Superior. The interceptor became airborne from Kinross Air Force Base, Michigan, at 1822 EST. Original radar control of the aircraft was maintained by "Naples" GCI and at 1841 EST control was transferred to "Pillow" GCI. The aircraft was flying at 30,000 feet at this time, At 1847 EST, at the request of "Pillow", the aircraft descended to 7,000 feet to begin the interception. Location of the aircraft was then approximately 150 miles northeast from Kinross AFB and over northern Lake Superior. At 1851 EST, the interceptor pilot was requested to turn to a heading of 20 degrees to the cut-off vector. After the turn was completed, the pilot was advised the unidentified aircraft was at 11 o'clock, 10 miles distant. Radar returns from both aircraft were then seen to merge on "Pillow's" radar scope. The radar return from the other aircraft indicated it was continuing on its original flight path, while the return from the F-89 disappeared from the GCI station's radar scope.

The unknown aircraft being intercepted was a Royal Canadian Air Force Dakota (C-47), Serial No. VC-912, flying from Winnipeg to Sudbury, Canada. At the time of interception, it was crossing Northern lake Superior from west to east at 7,000 feet.

The pilot and radar observer were assigned to the 433rd Fighter-interceptor Squadron, Truax AFB, Wisconsin. They were on temporary duty at Kinross AFB, Michigan, while the base's regularly assigned personnel were firing gunnery at Yuma, Arizona. The pilot had a total of 811:00 hours of which 121:40 hours were in F-89 type aircraft. He had 101:00 instrument hours and 91:50 hours night time. The radar observer had a total of 206:45 hours of which 11:30 hours were at night.

Search for the missing aircraft was conducted by both USAF and RCAF aircraft without success. Although 80 per cent area coverage was reported, heavy snows precluded effective land search. All civilian reports of seeing or hearing the aircraft were investigated with negative results.

< End photocopy pages >

ME2A 022
RR CA4A
DE ME2A 42
R 242215Z ZNJ
FM COMDR 520TH AD GP TRUAX FLD MADISON WIS
TO COMDR 534TH AD GP KINROSS AFB MICH
/R < Approx 15 characters excised > .D/TXOFS 4050
REQ YOU ACCEPT RESP FOR INVES OF A/C ACDT INVOLVING F-89c 51-5853
UNDER PROV PAR 19A CMR AFR 62-14, A/C FORMS FOR YOUR INVES W/B FWDD
WITHIN 24 HRS OF REC OF YOUR ACKMT.
24/2330Z NOV ME2A

23 November 1953 A/C NO 51-5853A Lt. Moncla

REQUEST FOR AUTHORIZATION OF TEMPORARY DUTY TRAVEL ORDERS OF MILITARY PERSONNEL
(This form authorizes an expenditure of Government finds and must be prepared accurately in every detail. Continue items on reverse if necessary.)

1. TO: Adjutant General or Adjutant [1002ND INSPECTOR GENERAL GROUP]
2. Date of Request [24 NOV ?S]

I. REQUEST FOR AUTHORIZATION

3. Activity Requesting Travel Orders (Complete Description)
[DIRECTORATE OF FLT SAFETY RESEARCH]

II. TEMPORARY DUTY TRAVEL ORDERS

4. Grade [MAJOR]
5. Last Name – First Name - Middle Initial [WATTS, RICHARD H. JR]
6. Service No [20432522]
7. Organization [1002ND I.G. GROUP]
8. Will Proceed O/A [24? NOV 53]
9. From: [NORTON AFB, CALIF]
10. To: (List Itinerary)
[TRUAX AFB, WISC - KINROSS AFB, WISC – MADISON, WISC]
11. Approx. No. of Days TDY (Include Travel Time) FIFTEEN
12. [X] Check if Authorized to vary Itinerary and Proceed to Such Additional Places as Necessary
for the Accomplishment of this Mission
13. Return To: [NORTON AFB, CALIF]
14. Purpose of temporary Duty (Check appropriate box and enter name of headquarters, if
applicable. Explain in detail.)
[[X] DF-?O [] COPY ____ TO CONDUCT SPECIAL INVES OF ACFT ACDT
INVOLVING TWO F-89 C ACFT]

III. TRANSPORTATION AUTHORIZED

15. State Mode of Transportation When Travel is “Directed When Available”
Tvl by Mil acft dir to Truax AFB, Wisc ? aval?
16. < Travel by private conveyance authorized – left blank >
17. < Travel by private conveyance authorized number of days – left blank >
18. Special Instructions [INDIV AUTH ACCESS TO CLAS MAT UP TO AND INC TOP
SECRET FOR PERIOD OF TDY]
19. Typed Name, Grade, Service and Title of Requesting Officer [JAMES I. CORNETT, COL,
USAF, CHIEF I&SE DIVISION]
20. Office Symbol [AFCFS-2A]
21. Phone No. [3204]
22. Signature of Requesting Officer < blank >

IV. AUTHORIZATION

REQUEST FOR TEMPORARY DUTY IS APPROVED AND WILL BE PERFORMED, TDN

23. Date of Order [24 NOV 54?]
24. Authority Number [450?]
25. Official Designation and Location of Approving Headquarters or Unit
[1002d Insp Gen Gp, Norton AFB, Calif]
26. Approved Under Authority Delegated By [AFR 36-58?]
27. Appropriate Account (?) [?F No. 782 G74734-? 443-5720 & 401-02 & 04-640?]
28. Typed Name, Grade, Service and Title of Adjutant General, or Adjutant Seal or Signature
< USAF Adjutant General Seal present >
[JAMES E. McM??OHN, 1st Lt., U.S. Air Force, Assistant Adjutant

DISTRIBUTION: B

[AIRCRAFT FLIGHT REPORT - Part I](#)

[AIRCRAFT INSPECTION AND MAINTENANCE RECORD - Part II](#)

[AIRCRAFT INSPECTION AND MAINTENANCE RECORD - Part II Continued](#)

[DELAYED CORRECTION DISCREPANCY LIST - Part III](#)

[DELAYED CORRECTION DISCREPANCY LIST - Part III Continued](#)

{450/MAC/240545Z}

23 November 1953 A/C NO 51-5853A Lt. Moncla

Q?

CA4A 002

00 S85 ZVA JEPNB JWPNT JEDEN JEPNB JEDBW JEDPK JEDFJ

00 JEPHQ JWPNT JEDEN JEPNB JEDBW JEDPK JEDFJ 777 .

DE CA4A 002

O 240505Z ZNJ

FM COMDR 534TH AD GP KINROSS AFB MICH

YO JEPHQ/DIR PLANS AND OPERATIONS HQ USAF WASH 25 D C

JWPNT/OFF INSP GEN USAF NORTON AFB CALIF

JEDEN/COMDR ADC ENT AFB COLORADO

JEDEN/COMDR EADF STEWART AFB NY

JEDEN/COMDR 30TH AIR DIV WILLOW RUN APRT BELLEVILLE MICH

JEDEN/COMDR 4706TH DEF WG OHARE INTL APRT PARK RIDGE ILL

JEDEN/COMDR 520TH AIR DEF GP TRUAX AFB WISC

/R E S T R I C T E D/COMM 002/MISSING ACFT REPORT/PD

1. PILOT 1ST LT FELIX F. MONCLA JR. AO01858910. RADAR OBSERVER:
2ND LT. ROBERT L. WILSON AO03005692.
2. TYPE AIRCRAFT: F-89C
3. AIRCRAFT NUMBER: 51-5853
4. HOME BASE OF AIRCRAFT: TRUAX AFB MADISON WISCONSIN.
5. HOME BASE OF PILOT: TRUAX AFB MADISON WISCONSIN.
6. PLACE OF DEPARTURE: KINROSS AFB KINROSS MICH.
7. TIME OF DEPARTURE: 2322 ZULU 23 NOV 53.
8. INTENDED DESTINATION: KINROSS AFB KINROSS MICH.
9. ROUTE AS DIRECTED BY ADCC ON ACTIVE AIR DEFENSE MISSION
10. ESTIMATED TIME ENROUTE: ONE HOUR

PAGE TWO CA4A 002

11. POSITION LAST REPORTED: AT COORDINATES 45 DEGREES 00 MINUTES NORTH
- 86 DEGREES 49 MINUTES WEST.
12. WEATHER OVER ROUTE: FOUR THOUSAND OVERCAST VISIBILITY EIGHT MILES
AT POINT OF DEPARTURE LOWERING TO FIVE HUNDRED OBSCURED VISIBILITY
ONE MILE IN LIGHT SNOW IN VICINITY WHERE ACFT WAS LAST REPORTED.
13. RMKS: ACFT WAS UNDER GCI CONTROL. RADAR CONTACT AND VOICE
COMMUNICATION WERE LOST AT 2339 ZULU AT COORDINATES FORTY EIGHT
DEGREES ZERO MINUTES NORTH EIGHTY SIX DEGREES FORTY NINE MINUTES
WEST.

24/0530Z NOV CA4A

THIS IS A TRUE COPY OF THE OFFICIAL SE??ING AIRCRAFT REPORT

/S/

DAVID C. COLLINS

Captain USAF

Aircraft Accident Investigating Officer

23 November 1953 A/C NO 51-5853A Lt. Moncla

WEATHER SUMMARY

23 November 1953

The weather in the vicinity of the last known position of the F-89 lost on a scramble on the evening of the 23rd of November 1953 is presumed to be the following:

A low centered over Northern Minnesota moving to the East. A cold front extended South from the low thru central Minnesota, Iowa and Eastern Kansas. The local area was under the influence of a fresh South-Westerly flow ahead of the approaching cold front.

The Eastern half of Lake Superior was covered with an overcast of stratocumulus bases generally 2000 ft to the West and 3000 ft to the East. Tops variable 5 - 8000 ft. A broken layer of Alto stratus formed the second layer base generally 8000 ft to the West 10000 ft to the East. Tops 12000 - 14000 ft Some? Scattered Cirrus at 18 - 20000 ft was observed in the area. Visibilities generally 8 - 10 miles over entire area.

Scattered snow showers were moving thru the area causing locally, ceilings as? low? As 500 ft and visibilities 1 - 2 miles in light snow.

Analysis of the radiosondes taken at Sault Ste Marie at approximately 1630E indicated moderate to heavy iceing in all clouds. The air being quite stable, indicates Rime iceing to predominate and generally little or no turbulence.

Winds from the surface to 20000 ft were generally Westerly. 260 Deg/10 kts at 5000 ft - 260 Deg/30 kts at 10000 ft - 270 Deg/35 kts at 20000 ft.

Temperatures were - 6 Deg/5000 ft - 8 Deg at 10000 ft - 18 Deg at 15000 ft and 25 Deg at 20000 ft.

HOURLY OBSERVATIONS FDF TO 1930E WERE AS FOLLOWS:

1730E) CMX E20(+)3S - 929/35/28SSE14/927/SB50
INR 30()E80()9 986/34/31SE5/945
GMI 20()E 100()200()15+ 980/33/31S9/942

1830E) CMX S1 E20(+)2S- 919/32/32SSE12/924
INR E40()80()8 000/35/30SE10/949
GMI 20DE100(+)15+ 976/33/30SSE8/940

1930E) GMX S2 P5X1S- 919/32/31SSE8/924
INR M27(+)8 991/35/32SE10/947
GMI 20(+)E 100(+)15+ 949/38/31S10/933

A CERTIFIED TRUE COPY OF HOURLY WEATHER

/S/
HAROLD A. WARD
Captain, USAF
Deputy Detachment Commander
Detachment 19, 12th Weather Sq
Kinross AFB, Kinross, Mich

23 November 1953 A/C NO 51-5853A Lt. Moncla

C E R T I F I C A T E

I certify that the F-89 aircraft 51-5853A listed as missing on 23 November 1953 was on an active Air Defense mission and in accordance with ADC Regulation 55-28 dated 14 Feb, 1952. A DD Form 175 or a similar flight clearance form was not required.

/S/
DAVID C. COLLINS
Captain USAF
Aircraft Accident Investigating Officer

23 November 1953 A/C NO 51-5853A Lt. Moncla

3 December 1953

C E R T I F I C A T E

1. The following Technical Orders were noted on Part III of the Form 1 as not complied with for F-89C 5105853A.
 - a. T.O.01-1-476 Replacement Exchange of Type B-8 stick grip.
 - b. T.O. 01-15DC-1 Not in A/C.
 - c. T.O. 02B-1-17 Compounding the Ignition System
 - d. T.O. 01-15FDC-172 Installation R.O's Interphone cutout SW.
 - e. T.O. 02B-1050-73 Removal of Latch.

/S/
DAVID C. COLLINS
Captain USAF
Aircraft Accident Investigating Officer

23 November 1953 A/C NO 51-5853A Lt. Moncla

24 November 1953

Maintenance Report for A/C/ 51-5853A

Aircraft 51-5853A was given a thorough preflight inspection at approx. 07:30 on 23 Nov 53. No discrepancies were found during this inspection

Aircraft 51-5853A was "scrambled" at 11:45 hours and returned at 12:45 hours. The pilots remarks in the AF Form I were Flt #1 "ok".

The A/C/ was immediately serviced and spot checked for worn tires, cleared engine intakes, oil, hydraulic tank levels, oxygen, nitrogen. All servicing caps and covers were securely replaced and the A/C was towed into the alert hangar where it was returned to number one aircraft on 5 minute alert status.

The aircraft was again scrambled at approx 18:15 hours without encountering any difficulty before take-off.

/s/

RAYMOND C. RICHARDS
T/Sgt, AF 13162361
NCOIC 433rd FIS

A CERTIFIED TRUE COPY

/S/

DAVID C. COLLINS
Captain USAF
Aircraft Accident Investigating Officer

23 November 1953 A/C NO 51-5853A Lt. Moncla

< This following page also is obviously a modern photocopy because of the difference in the image and background density and the paper finish. It is also, however, obviously a copy of an older page because of the edge of the original page showing with "curl." It appears that this may be a copy of a print made from the microfilm made to add redaction information. These redaction notices are in the form of "rubber stamp" notations and brackets made with what appears to be a "felt tip" pen. The redaction notices are indicated below by the use of curly brackets { } >

I N D E X
T O

AIRCRAFT ACCIDENT REPORT

Aircraft F-89C, Number 51-5853A, Pilot - 1st Lt Felix E. Moncla Jr:

Date: 23 November 1953

- A. TWX with authority to investigate accident
- B. Missing aircraft report
- C. TWX suspending search for missing aircraft
- D. Preliminary report
- E. Air Force Form 14
- F. Air Force Form 14A
- G. Air Force Form 14B (Lt. Moncla) {Medical Data WITHHELD}
- H. Air Force Form 14B (Lt. Wilson) {Medical Data WITHHELD}
- I. Pillow (665th AC&W SQ) Controllers statement {WITHHELD}
- J. Statement by Capt Bridges {WITHHELD}
- K. Statement by Capt Mingenbach {WITHHELD}
- L. Statement by Lt. Nordeck {WITHHELD}
- M. Weather forecast and Weather sequence for Kinross (INR) Houghton CMX) and Grand Maria (GMI)
- N. Statement on weather by pilot of aircraft being intercepted {WITHHELD}
- O. Accident investigation board proceedings {WITHHELD}
- P. Statement of aircraft clearance
- Q. Form I Part I
- R. Form I Part II

- S. Form I Part III
- T. List of T.O'S not complied with
- U. Maintenance report on aircraft
- V. Overlay map

23 November 1953 A/C NO 51-5853A Lt. Moncla

49TH AIR RESCUE SQUADRON
5TH AIR RESCUE GROUP (ARS-MATS)
Selfridge Air Force Base, Michigan

OPS 6-11 28 MAY 1954

Mission Number. 5-49-24-23 November 1953 (Reopened)

Objective. AF 5853/F-89/Moncla/Kinross/Alert Scramble/Unk/UHF/1822E/Unk/1 plus 45/3-2/9.

Date of Suspension. 23 May 1954.

Source and Time of Initial Alert. Headquarters, 5th Air Rescue group at 0950L, 16 April 1954.

Date and Time of Initial Dispatch of ARS Facilities. SA-16 AF 7167 airborne at 0757L, 13 May 1954, for snow reconnaissance.

Synopsis. T 095L, 16 April 1954, the Operations Officer of Headquarters, 5th Air Rescue group, called relating that new leads had been uncovered on this mission by the missing radar operator's father, Mr. R.O. Wilson. The information had been forwarded to this Squadron through channels requesting reopening of the mission based on reports of a low flying aircraft in the vicinity of Limer, Ontario, Canada which would correlate with the time of the missing F-89. This information had been reported and investigated during the original prosecution of the mission, but was determined to have no relative bearing on the incident because of time differentiation. Since that time the individual reporting the low flying aircraft stated he may have been mistaken in the time.

The information was received by this Squadron on 6 May 1954, and positive search action was planned for on or about 10 May 1954 with the advanced base to be located at Kinross AFB, Michigan. In the meantime, information on the snow conditions in the proposed search area were obtained from Canadian sources. The snow condition on 16 April 1954, was reported from two (2) to four (4) feet deep with an estimated date of 10 May 1954, when snow would disappear. Arrangements were also made with the Royal Canadian Air Force Search and Rescue Centre, Trenton, Ontario, Canada, to reopen the mission and to fly over Canada. Mr. Wilson was contacted for any further information, and he wished to be notified when the mission was actually reopened in order that he might be present at Kinross AFB, Michigan, during the actual search.

The weather was reported below minimums in the search area on the estimated date of reopening, but a continued check indicated improvement by 13 May 1954. At 0757L, 13 May 1954, SA-16 AF 7167 reported southern part of search area clear, but northern sector had some snow and the lakes were covered with ice, but with rising temperatures should be clear within four (4) or five (5) days.

[PHOTOGRAPHS OF SEARCH AREA](#)

OVERLAY MAP < Too poor of a quality to reproduce >

INDEX OF TABULAR MATERIAL

- A. Orders Directing the Investigation
- B. List of Personnel Participating in the Investigation
- C. Statistical data

D. Missing Aircraft Report, Preliminary report, Search Discontinuance Report
E. Form 14A, Pilot's Flight Records, radar Observer's Flight Records
F. Pilot's Activities Prior to Flight
G. Scramble Clearance, Weather
H. Statements, Ground Controller's Report
{I. Accident Board Proceedings Not Releasable }
J. Area Map with Bogey's and Interceptor's Positions Plotted
K Aircraft Engineering data

[INDIVIDUAL FLIGHT RECORD - AIRCRAFT OBSERVER < Page 1 of 2 >](#)

[INDIVIDUAL FLIGHT RECORD - AIRCRAFT OBSERVER < Page 2 of 2 >](#)

[INDIVIDUAL FLIGHT RECORD - PILOT](#)

[WEIGHT AND BALANCE CLEARANCE FORM F - TACTICAL](#)

[SECTION II - SUMMARY OF PILOT EXPERIENCE](#)

REPORT ON SEARCH FOR MISSING
F-89 (SCORPION) 5853
Coordinated by the Eastern Area Rescue Co-ordination Centre
TCHQ, Trenton, Ontario
OPERATION SAR SCORPION

Appendices:

- "A" Weather Situation at the time of the Interception carried out by the Missing Aircraft 23 Nov 53.
- "B" Search Plan
- "C" Aircraft Deployed
- "D" Daily Search Coverage and Flying Times
- "E" Breakdown of Flying Time by Aircraft
- "F" Photograph of the Search Area
- "G" Photograph of the Search Area

GENERAL SITUATION

1 Eastern Area RCC was alerted by the 49th Air Rescue Squadron, USAF, Selfridge, at 2200 hrs EST 23 Nov 53 re a F89C all-weather fighter believed to be down NW of Sault Ste Marie. The aircraft Scorpion 5853 with a crew consisting of Pilot, 1st Lt F.R. Moncla, and Radar observer 2nd Lt R. Wilson, was scrambled from Kinross Air Force Base at 1822 EST on a routine flight. Radio and radar contact with Scorpion 5853 was lost at 1855 EST, position 4800N 8649W. prior to the loss of radio and radar contact with the Scorpion, the pilot had received and acknowledged a steer to base of 150 Deg T and a new track to fly of 020 Deg Magnetic. At the time of the take off the aircraft had an hour and forty-five minutes fuel aboard. The aircraft is a twin-engined jet all weather fighter with the rear fuselage curved up, giving it the appearance of a Scorpion. The aircraft was silver in colour with American markings. The only emergency equipment carried by the crew of the aircraft was a one-man dingy for each member.

INITIAL ACTION

2 The normal communications checks were carried out by Selfridge Rescue with negative results. The Ontario Provincial Police were alerted and information placed with radio stations in Sault Ste Marie, Mich, and Sault Ste Marie, Ont. The Ontario Department of Lands and Forests made a communications check of their own radio stations in the

probability area with negative results.

3 Due to the extremely bad weather existing between Trenton and Kinross on the evening of 23 Nov 53, the SAR Dakota from 102 C&R Unit carrying the searchmaster, assistant searchmaster and para rescue team was unable to take off until the following morning. The same weather situation affected the departure time of the additional search aircraft from Stn Centralia.

ORGANIZATION

4 Search headquarters was set up at Kinross USAF Base at 1215 EST 24 Nov 53 with F/L F. Campbell, 102 C&R Flight Trenton as Searchmaster

- 2 -

and F/O B.R. Ketcheson, RCC TCHQ as assistant. Co-ordination of the search, prior to the arrival of the NCAF Searchmaster was provided by Captain Meyer of Selfridge Air Rescue Base, USAF. This officer remained at Kinross as liaison officer until 26 Nov when he was replaced by Capt Davenport from Selfridge, who remained at Kinross until completion of the search.

SEARCH PLAN

5 Prior to the arrival of the RCAF Searchmaster and search aircraft, the United States Coast Guard provided one SA16 and one surface vessel. The 49th Air Rescue Squadron provided two SA16's. These aircraft and the surface vessel carried out an expanding square search in the area of 4800N 8649W during the night of 23 Nov and the following day. Additional aircraft were not dispatched by the Searchmaster on 24 Nov because of poor weather and the unknown position of the SA16 executing a square search in the probability area.

6 The initial search blocks were laid out to cover 60 miles west of the last reported position the Datum Line along 090 Deg true and the remaining squares covering the area to the east. It was the opinion of the other jet crews from Kinross who were interviewed that normally the missing pilot's first move at any sign of trouble would have been to turn on his homing of 150 Deg. With this probability in mind, further search blocks were out to the east, south and south-east.

7 Except for the initial night search, no additional night search was carried out because of bad weather and the lack of emergency equipment carried by the crew of the missing Scorpion.

8 The areas covered were searched from 1000' using 2 miles visibility. Coastline searches were carried out at 500' and 1/2 mile visibility along the east and north shore of the Lake from Sault Ste Marie to Simpson Island (4850N 8743W) and return to Marquette (4633N 8723W) and return.

WEATHER

9 Generally, the weather conditions throughout the search period were poor. Crews were constantly hampered with low ceilings and reduced visibility. On the afternoon of 25 Nov and the morning 26 Nov 53 operations were seriously delayed by the search aircraft being laden with ice on the ground.

COMMUNICATIONS

10 W/T and R/T contact wee maintained by the majority of aircraft with the Ontario Department of Lands and Forests' ground stations. All other aircraft maintained contact, when possible, with radio stations at Houghton, Grand Marie, and Sault Ste Marie.

11 Aircraft were provided by the 49th Search and Rescue Squadron in the form of two SA16s, four C45s and a B25; Kinross provided 1 C47 and one helicopter. US Coast Guard at Traverse city provided 1 SA16, the Civilian Air Patrol provided 1 Cessna 140, the RCAF provided 3 C47s from Centralia and 1 C47 from Trenton.

GROUND REPORTS

12 Numerous ground reports were received, the majority of which upon investigation were discounted. An overheard radio transmission discussing aircraft wreckage was traced to its origin in South Bend Indiana . The wreckage referred to was the wreckage of another missing aircraft which was eventually located in that area.

- 3 -

13 Two clues - - one obtained on the 25 Nov and the other on 27 Nov, were considered reliable. The first from a mail carrier who claimed he thought he saw the wreckage of an aircraft in the water in the Cut River Bridge area (455730N 8457W). Michigan state police searched the area three times and discounted his sighting as rocks. The second clue was reported as the sighting of wreckage of an aircraft on the side of a mountain on the eastern shore of the lake about 80 miles north of Kinross (472330N 844110W). This area was searched exhaustively by an Expeditor, a Dakota, a B25 and finally a Helicopter with negative results.

CONCLUSIONS

14 Because of the inability to determine the cause of the aircraft's disappearance the search was expanded to cover all possibilities, but was greatly hampered by bad weather and icing conditions.

15 Despite intensive aerial search and the careful check of all ground reports, no trace of the missing aircraft could be found. After a conference with USAF authorities and with their concurrence active search was suspended the evening of 28 Nov 53.

16 The co-operation shown to the searchmaster, his assistant and the Canadian crews, by the USAF authorities at Kinross Air Force Base was exceptionally good.

/s/

(R.H. Stroute) S/L
for AOC, TC.

APPENDIX "A"
TO 976-3 (SC&T/AT4)
DATED 18 DEC 53

WEATHER SITUATION ALONG THE ROUTE OF THE MISSING AIRCRAFT

1 The weather conditions existing over eastern Lake Superior at the time contact was lost with the missing F89, was forecast to be the following. A generally solid deck of Stratocumulus base from 2-3000 and top at 6-7000 feet. A broken Altostratus layer, base 10,000 to 14-15000 feet. The visibility was generally 10-12 miles falling to 1-2 miles in isolated snow showers. The freezing level was at the surface to the west, rising to 800 - 1000 feet in the east. Analysis of the Sault Ste Marie Radio Sonde Run for 2100Z (1600E) indicates that moderate to heavy icing could occur from the cloud base to 7000 feet. The air was quite stable and rime ice should have predominated. No turbulence or other hazard would have been encountered. The winds were light south-easterly at the surface shifting to west aloft.

APPENDIX "B"
TO 976-3 (SC&T/AT4)
DATED 18 DEC 53

SEARCH PLAN

1 The following Datum Points and Datum Lines were used to plot search areas:

AREA DATUM POINT DATUM LINE

RED 48:00N 87:47W 090 Deg (T)
BROWN 46:15N 85:15W 090 Deg (T)
BLUE 48:00N 85:47W 090 Deg (T)
GREEN 46:15N 87:15W 090 Deg (T)

APPENDIX "C"
TO 976-3 (SC&T/AT4)
DATED 18 DEC 53

AIRCRAFT DEPLOYED

1 USAF AIRCRAFT

057 Dakota	Kinross
5286 SA16	Selfridge
7167 SA16	Selfridge
0849 B25	Selfridge
7163 C45	Selfridge
1620 C45	Ohare
1616 C45	Ohare
913 C45 Oscoda3961 H15? (helicopter)	Kinross

2 US COAST GUARD AIRCRAFT

SA16	Traverse City
------	---------------

3 RCAF AIRCRAFT

653 Dakota	Trenton
961 Dakota	Centralia
641 Dakota	Centralia
658 Dakota	Centralia

4 CIVIL AIRCRAFT

Cessna 140 Civilian Air Patrol	Sault Ste Marie, Mich.
--------------------------------	------------------------

SURFACE CRAFT EMPLOYED

1 US COAST GUARD

USCG "WOODRUSH"	Sault Ste Marie, Mich.
-----------------	------------------------

APPENDIX "D"
TO 976-3 (SC&T/AT4)
DATED 18 DEC 53

DAILY SEARCH COVERAGE AND FLYING TIMES

DATE	COVERAGE	SEARCH	TRANSIT
24 Nov 53	3,000 sq mi	14:00	10:15

25 Nov 53	6,000 sq mi	31:55	4:20
26 Nov 53	600 sq mi	3:00	NIL
27 Nov 53	13,500 sq mi	39:05	10:25
28 Nov 53	6,500 sq mi	30:25	NIL
TOTALS	29, 600 sq miles	113:25	25:00

APPENDIX "E"
TO 976-3 (SC&T/AT4)
DATED 18 DEC 53

BREAKDOWN OF FLYING TIMES BY AIRCRAFT

1 USAF

DAKOTAS	11:35
C45s	21:00
SA16s	18:25
B25	3:20
H19	3:00
Total	57:20

2 US COAST
GUARD

SA16	14:00
Total	14:00

3 RCAF

DAKOTAS	69:35
Total	69:35

4 CIVIL

CESSNA 140	2:30
Total	2:30
GRAND TOTAL	143:25